Oct 1913

Copy of letter

631

Toronto, Oct. 8th., 1913.

Mr. F.A.Moure,

Bursar, University of Toronto,

Queen's Park, City

Dear Sir:-

A short time ago the Governors of the Toronto Western Hospital received from the University of Toronto a copy of a statement sent to the Governors of the University by a Committee of the Medical Staff of the Hospital. This statement calls for a reply.

At the meeting of the Hospital Governors held on Oct. 9th., 1912, the draft agreement regarding teaching was read. It was then explained fully what had been done in an informal way by some of the Governors of the Hospital in the matter of admitting students to the Hospital. All the Medical Governors, including Drs. Clouse, Beatty and McCullough, were present. The memo of the agreement was read and discussed, clause by clause. It was then moved by Dr. A.A.Macdonald and seconded by Mr. Sigmund Samuel and unanimously carried.

"That the memo for basis of agreement to be made between the Governors of the University and the Governors of the Toronto Western Hospital forwarded from the former to the latter institution, having been carefully considered by the Governors of the Toronto Western Hospital, is hereby approved and ordered to be spread upon the minutes,

and that this decision be forwarded to the President of the University of Toronto."

At the meeting of the Governors on Oct. 15th.,1912, Drs. Beatty and Clouse were present along with others. The minutes of the 9th., of October were read and confirmed without opposition or dissent. These minutes contained the Memo of agreement.

At the meeting of the Hospital Governors held on the 6th of January, 1913, the agreement forward from the University was read and discussed, clause by clause, when Dr. A. A. Macdonald moved and Mr. Sigmund Samuel seconded.-

" That the Chairman of the Board and the Secretary be authorized to sign the agreement between the University of Toronto and the Toronto Western Hospital, referring to the admission of Students and the appointment of Members of the Staff as teachers and associate Professors of the University of Toronto." This was carried unanimously, and Dr. Clouse and Dr. Beatty were present.

At the meeting of the Board of Governors on the 10th., of February, 1913, these minutes were read and unanimously confirmed, Drs., Beatty and Clouse being present.

The Medical Staff held a meeting on the 15th of January 1913, which was well attended. Dr. A. A. Macdonald, Dean, made a statement regarding the agreement , the admission of Students, and the formation of teaching services. After hearing the explanation, Dr. W. C. Heggie moved and it was duly seconded, " That we accept the agreement with the

University, leaving the appointments in the hands of the President of the University," This was carried unanimously Drs.Jas. McCullough, H. A. Beatty and E. Clouse being present. Dr. Beatty said that affiliation with the University would be an asset th the Hospital. These minutes were confirmed at a Staff meeting on the 5th of February, 1913.

The agreement was signed about the 20th of January, 1913, and sent to the University. A little later the names of the four who had been appointed associate professors were made known.

Shortly after this Dr. Webster commenced an agitation against the agreement among his friends on the Staff. He frequently said he would not accept a position second to Dr. Macdonald. A few members of the Staff, who are disposed to cavil at almost everything, sided with him. Jealousies over the appointments were harped upon and spread. These discontented Members, together with a n umber of the old Members on the consulting portion of the Staff, and a few of the younger Members, who were, no doubt, misled, made the total vote which was given on one occasion for a resolution asking that the agreement be rescinded. These members do not represent that element of the Staff that has built up the Hospital. The fact is, that nearly all those who have opposed the agreement have done very little for the Hospital.

It was felt when the Board of Governors had several times, and without a dissenting voice, approved of the agreement and the Staff had also unanimously done the same, it would then be in order to have it executed and returned to the University. Those who are now opposing the agreement

take advantage of two or three expressions in the Act Incorporating the Hospital to rest their case on, that the agreement infringes the rights of the Staff.

It will be seen from this statement that the Governors of the Hospital, with three exceptions, have acted fairly by all parties concerned. These three exceptions are, Drs. Beatty, Clouse and McCullough, all of whom approved of the agreement at the Board meetings and at the Staff meeting, but have now turned their backs upon their own records.

There is just enough in the Act of Incorporation to give possible ground for legal action. The Governors of the Hospital feel that they could win at Law without difficulty, but feel that this would not be in the interests of either the Hospital or the University, and , therefore now ask that the teaching be left in abeyance for a short time, until they have had the opportunity of having the Act of Incorporation amended soas to remove every element of doubt.

Any statements made by the committee of the Staff to the effect, that the agreement was irregularly entered into, or that any one on the part of the Hospital in any way deceived those who acted for the University are quite false and misleading. Those who acted on behalf of the Hospital conducted everything in the most open manner. They also enjoy the confidence of those who have done the work of building up the Hospital.

The statement made by the committee of the Staff

that unless the Staff is united the teaching of Students would be a failure, is wholly incorrect. The Gentlemen in the various services require neither help nor sympathy from those on the Staff who are not also on the services. When the Act of the Hospital is amended these apparent difficulties will at once disappear. If every one of those opposing the agreement resigned now, the Hospital would go no just as well, both as to number of patients and income.

Any statements reflecting upon the name and conduct of Dr.A. A. Macdonald, the Dean, are misleading and incorrect. He gave a fair explanation of the agreement to the Staff at its meeting on the 15th of January, 1913. This is borne out by the fact that Drs. McCullough Beatty and Clouse were present and did not object to what he had said, but on the contrary Dr. Beatty spoke in its support, and permitted Dr. Heggie's motion expressing approval, to be carried unanimously. Drs. Beatty and Clouse had also been present at the meeting of the Governors on the 6th of January, when the agreement was read and unanimously ordered to be signed.

At a meeting of the Staff on the 13th of February, 1913, a motion was made by Dr. Webster censuring Dr. Macdonald for the statement he had made on the 15th of January. This was lost, and thereupon the mover asked that he be allowed to withdraw his motion. It was unanimously agreed then that his expression of censure be withdrawn.

This brief statement shows that Drs. McCullough,

Beatty and Clouse, Members of the Board of Governors, and also of the Staff are now opposing the very agreement which at one time they supported.

The Medical gentlemen of the Staff who have procured donations to the Hospital are practically limited to Drs. Macdonald, PriceBrown and Ferguson, and the principal Donors are Messrs. D.Fasken, Sir E. Osler., Sir. Wm. McKenzie, W.G.Trethewey, H.Langlois, H.C.Tomlin, Massey Harris Company, W.R.Johnston Company, Noel Marshall, Rufus Hudson, W.Francis and Garnet Grant. These are all in favor of admitting students.

I apologize for the length of this communication, but feel that the action of certain members of the Board of Governors and the Staff have made a somewhat full statement of the case necessary.

I am,

Yours very truly,

Secretary of the Board of Governors of the Toronto Western Hospital.